# NOMINATION OF THE GALLAGHER-KIEFFER HOUSE TO BE DESIGNATED AS A CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK

CITY COUNCIL REPORT



# GALLAGHER-KIEFFER HOUSE - HISTORIC NOMINATION STAFF REPORT

Name of Property	Gallagher-Kieffer House
Address of Property	
Property Owner	
Nominated by:	Matthew Falcone
Date Received:	15 May 2020
Parcel No.:	27-H-115
Ward:	4th
Zoning Classification:	RM-VH
Neighborhood	North Oakland
Council District:	8 - Strassburger

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE HISTORIC REVIEW COMMISSION:

- 1. Act on the Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for Historic Designation 1 July 2020)
- 2. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (5 Aug 2020)
- 3. Review the Report prepared by staff for the property in question, and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (5 Aug 2020)

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION:

- 4. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (25 Aug 2020)
- 5. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (15 Sept 2020)

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE CITY COUNCIL:

- 6. Conduct a public hearing within 120 days of the Planning Commission vote
- 7. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and the City Planning Commission and take action on the Historic Designation

# FACTS

1. On 15 May 2020, the staff of the Historic Review Commission received an application for the nomination of the Gallagher-Kieffer House to be designated as a City Historic Structure.

#### 2. Description of the Gallagher-Kieffer House (as *extracted from the nomination form*)

Sited at 234 North Dithridge Street, Pittsburgh, PA 15213 (Parcel ID 0027-H-00115-0000-00), the subject building is a two-and-one-half-story, wood-frame, residential dwelling. Built ca. 1893, the building is an example of the late nineteenth century, Victorian Period, Shingle Style. Specifically, the building represents an adaptation of the style to the four-square building typology.

The building rises from a full, roughhewn, coursed ashlar sandstone foundation. The basement-level is visually separated from the first floor by a flared, wood belt course. The first floor is clad in a thin- profile wood clapboard. All exterior corners on the first floor are clad with thin, stylized pilasters. The first and second floors are visually separated by an unadorned wood entablature surmounted by flared cedar shingles. The visual separation between the second floor and the building's roof begins immediate above the second-floor window openings. Here, a thin molding is surmounted by three courses of flared cedar shingles. Above the course of shingles, a composite cornice/box gutter projects at the roof line.

The building possesses a cross-gable roof with a steeply-pitched, side-gable gambrel at the front and a standard end-gable roof extending at the rear. Four chimneys penetrate the building's roofline. Each chimney is of brick construction and features a two-course collar and six-course corbelled crown. Each chimney is capped with dressed stone coping.

#### Southwest (Front) Façade

The southwest (front) façade is divided into three irregular bays. Reading the building from left to right (northwest to southeast), on the first floor, bay one is occupied by a window opening fitted with three medieval, wood-sash, leaded-glass casement windows. Each casement window is surmounted by a fixed, wood sash window with leaded and stained-glass.

The fixed sashes comprise a triptych, presumably serving as an allegory of life that was historically called "Greek Riddle of the Sphinx" by the Gallagher family. From left to right (interior) the sashes feature three grisaille panels. The first panel depicts a rising sun with a nude child chasing a butterfly. A sapling stands in the middle ground. The second panel depicts a man, clad in a tunic and shin guards, holding a sword. A young tree stands in the middle ground. The third panel depicts a robed, seated figure holding a scythe. This likely depicts death. A mature tree stands in the middle ground and a waning crescent moon is present in the sky.

Bays two and three recede beneath a porch. Bay two features a window opening fitted with four wood- sash, leaded and stained-glass casement windows. One stained-glass medallion is set within each casement. Each depicts a scene, which, from left to right (interior), are a lighthouse, a garden, a sailing ship, and a medieval castle.

Bay three is fitted with the building's front door. The door is paneled with a glazed opening. The wood muntins within the opening form a symmetric, geometric pattern of diamonds and rectangles. Door hardware is of brass construction and features a doorknocker and off-centered mail slot.

Bays two and three are fronted by a semi-integral porch. The porch rises from piers and possesses wood decking. It is encircled by a wood balustrade with simple, chamfered balusters. Theporch possesses a hipped roof clad with asphalt shingles. The roof is supported by chamfered wood columns with stylized capitals. A clapboard-clad knee wall extends to the right of bay three. On the knee wall, a more substantial squared column supports a cantilevered portion of the second floor.

On the second floor, bays one and two are occupied by paired, wood-sash, twenty-four light, leaded glass casement windows. Each of the casement windows is surmounted by fixed, wood, twelve-light, leaded glass sashes. Bay three is comprised of a projecting bay window that is supported by the porch below. The bay features ten wood-sash, twenty-four-light, leaded glass casement windows. Every other window is designed to

be operable. Each window is surmounted by a leaded and stained-glass transom sash. The operability of the transom sashes corresponds with the operability of the casement below.

One medallion is set within each transom sash. Some feature figural grisaille while others are rendered in stained-glass. Most of these figural medallions are linked to either Greek mythology or the Christian faith. From left to right (interior), there is a Caduceus flanked by the Latin words SALVS VITAE (interpreted as "Safety, Life"); an anchor entwined with a serpent and the letters T B, symbolizing Christ and salvation; a flaming sword with the Latin phrase BELLVM HIT AVARITIA CONTA (loosely interpreted as "War Against Greed"); the Gallchobhair (Gallagher) Family Crest; a scene depicting the Saint Nicholas rescuing three children from the Evil Butcher, Our Lady of Pity (bookplate from the printer John Byddell, 1533), and the book plate from the king's printer, Reyonld Wolfe (the king's printer), 1542, among others.

The roofline is visually demarcated by a projecting box gutter and cornice. Two metal downspouts descend from the box gutter on either side of the southwest (front) façade. The front portion of the dwelling is surmounted by a side-gable gambrel roof. Two shingled dormers project above the roofline. Each possess a squared, front-gable dormer that is a key character defining feature of the Shingle style.Each dormer is fitted with paired, wood sash, twenty-eight-light, leaded glass casement windows.

The southeast (side) façade is divided into three irregular bays. Due to the slope of topography, the basement level is partially exposed. Reading the façade from left to right (southwest to northeast), at basement level, bay one features a window opening with a stone lug sill. The opening is fitted with a two-light, wood, awning-sash window. Bay two straddles the basement level and first floor, denoting the interior location of vertical circulation. It features a paired door and window, accessing the building at ground-level. On the basement level, bay three features a window opening with a stone lug sill and steel lintel. The opening is fitted with a two-light, wood awning sash window.

On the first floor, bay one is blind. Bay two straddles the first and second stories, featuring a large, projecting oriel window. The oriel is supported by nine simple brackets. The oriel features a window opening fitted with three, wood-sash, thirty-light, leaded-glass casement windows. Each window is surmounted by a fixed, leaded glass transom widow. The end transoms are of fifteen-light leaded glass construction. The central transom is of leaded and stained glass with a stained-glass medallion. Bay three features a window opening fitted with paired leaded glass casement windows. The glass is constructed in a complex, geometric diamond pattern.

On the second floor, bays one and three feature window openings fitted with modern, double-hung window units. The bottom sash is one-light. The upper sash exhibits false muntins arranged in a diaper pattern. Above the roofline, the side gable of the gambrel roof prominently features a tripartite Palladian window. All windows have been replaced with modern units.

#### Northeast (Rear) Façade

The northeast (rear) façade is divided into five irregular bays. At the rear of the building, the basement level is fully exposed. Reading the façade from left to right (southeast to northwest), on the ground level, bay one features a window opening with a stone lug sill. The opening is fitted with a two-light, wood, awning-sash window. Bay two features a door opening with a trabeated stone lintel. It is fitted with a modern steel slab door. To the right (northwest) of the door is a wood clapboard-enclosed room beneath the house's projecting first floor pantry and porch. A stair runs adjacent to the enclosed room and accesses the porch. Beneath the porch, a void is enclosed by latticework. On the first floor, bay one is occupied by a window opening fitted with four wood-sash, leaded-glass casement windows. To the right (northwest) of the window, the projecting pantry and open porch occupy the remainder of the first floor. The pantry has one window opening facing southwest. It is fitted with a modern one-over-one-light, double-hung window. Partially enclosed by the pantry, the remainder of the porch is open. Opposite the pantry, an open porch accesses a door to the kitchen. The porch possesses a hipped roof clad in asphalt shingles. The open portion of the porch is supported by a Doric column resting on a wood clapboard-clad knee wall.

On the second story, bays one, two, four, and five feature window openings fitted with modern double- hung vinyl window units. The bottom sash is one-light. The upper sash exhibits false muntins arranged in a diaper pattern. Bay three features a window opening fitted with paired, wood-sash, leaded and stained-glass casement

windows. Above the roofline, the gable features four window openings. Each opening is fitted with modern, six-over-one-light, double-hung windows.

#### Northwest (Side) Façade

The northwest (side) façade is divided into three irregular bays. Due to the slope of topography, the basement level is partially exposed. Reading the façade from left to right (northwest to southeast), on the first story, bays one and two feature window openings fitted with modern, one-over- one-light, double-hung windows. Bay three features a projecting, enclosed side entrance. This side entrance connects with the interior landing of the rear service stair via an exterior stair. The enclosed projection possesses a northeast-facing window opening fitted with a casement window with a geometric, diamond pattern. Its roof is clad in asphalt shingles.

On the second floor, bays one, two, and three feature window openings of differing sizes. Bay one is fitted with a four-by-four-light, wood-sash casement window. Bay two is fitted with a modern, one- over-one-light, double-hung window. Bay three is fitted with modern, double-hung window. The bottom sash is one-light. The upper sash exhibits false muntins arranged in a diaper pattern.

Above the roofline, the side gable of the gambrel roof prominently features a tripartite Palladian window. The left opening is fitted with an original twelve-over-one-light, double-hung, wood sash window. The center and right openings have been fitted with modern, six-over-one-light, double-hung windows.

# **3. History of the Gallagher-Kieffer House** (as *extracted from the nomination form*)

The house was used as a rental from 1893 until 1914 and was home to such notable tenants as the Reverend Henry T. McClelland, who was tenure as pastor of the Bellefield Presbyterian Church, and Melvin Johnston, who was Vice President of Duffs-Iron City College.

Annie Davison hired the contracting firm of Bennett and Stitely to build the home at a cost of \$4,600. Available records do not identify an architect associated with the design of 234 (then 226) North Dithridge Street, which was constructed in the Shingle Style. This style of architecture is characterized by a brick, stone, or clapboard first floor with the second floor and third or partial third floor covered by wood shingles, and is reflected in 234 North Dithridge Street's steeply-pitched gambrel roof, shingled second floor walls without corner boards, and the absence of highly-decorative detailing.

In 1914, 234 North Dithridge Street was purchased by Patrick F. and Katharin Gallagher at a cost of \$10,000, although newspapers from the time reported that the transaction cost \$15,000. Patrick F. Gallagher was the President of Duquesne Construction Co., and helped to build many of the schools and churches around the Pittsburgh area, most notably Sacred Heart Roman Catholic Church in Shadyside and St. Boniface Church on the North Side.

The Gallaghers raised nine children at 234 North Dithridge Street and their descendants still live in the home today. The Gallagher House has been owned by only two families in its almost 130-year existence. The land on which 234 North Dithridge Street now stands was inherited by Isabella W. C. Comingo from her father, Neville B. Craig (Allegheny County Will Book 10: 421). Isabella outlived her husband and was in the process of partitioning and selling off her land when her last two living children died accidentally. It was said the deaths of her sons caused her to lose her sanity and all sales of her property in the preceding 18 months had to be reviewed by the courts to show the purchasers had given her a fair price and not taken advantage of Comingo's failing mental health.

Isabella Comingo died on July 23, 1889, and her estate was divided between her living siblings. Her sister, Annie Craig Davison, was granted lots six and seven in the partition proceedings of the estate of her sister Isabella W. C. Comingo at Orphan's Court September Term 1889, which is where 234 North Dithridge Street stands today. City of Pittsburgh Building Permit Dockets show that on July 29, 1893, Annie Davison received a permit to build a two-story and attic dwelling on Dithridge Street near Fifth Avenue. The house was to be 35 feet wide by 40 feet deep and would cost \$4,600.

Annie Davidson hired the firm of Bennett & Stitely to build 234 North Dithridge Street. Pittsburgh city directories published during the early 1890's show that Bennett & Stitely was a partnership of W.B. Bennett of 5708 Rural Street, East Liberty, and David Stitely of 5926 Mignonette Street, also East Liberty. Other work by

the firm of Bennett & Stitely included construction of homes at 900 and 921 College Avenue and a mansard roof addition at 309 Shady Avenue in Shadyside. Other work by W.B. Bennett included construction of the Sheridan Theatre in East Liberty and a home at 5639 Bartlett Street in Squirrel Hill. When 234 North Dithridge Street was constructed, it was numbered 226 North Dithridge Street. The house number was changed to 234 in 1918, possibly to standardize numbering on that block.

# ANNIE NEVILLE CRAIG DAVISON

Annie Neville Craig was born on July 11, 1831, the daughter of Neville B. and Jane Ann Fulton Craig. At the time she was born her father, Neville B. Craig, was Pittsburgh's City Solicitor and also the owner and editor of the Pittsburgh Gazette. He would later serve a term in the Pennsylvania House of Representatives in 1843. Annie married John S. Davison on May 1, 1855. Davison was in New York City on September 3, 1825. He was raised in New York and graduated from Princeton in 1844. In 1851, he moved to Pittsburgh and opened a bookstore, which later evolved into a hardware and saddlery store known as Mair & Davison.

The couple established a home at 4614 Fifth Avenue near the intersection of Craig Street, where they intended to raise their four children. John Roberts Davison was born on September 25, 1856, Neville Craig Davison was born January 3, 1860, Frederick was born June 11, 1862 and their youngest and only daughter, Mary Louisa or Mazzie, was born on April 6, 1864. The family was very active in the founding of the Bellefield Church and John Davison was both an elder and the superintendent of the church's Sunday school.

Unfortunately, tragedy would strike the Davison family. On July 2, 1868, John Roberts, then 12, was learning to swim at the confluence of the Beaver and Ohio Rivers when he drowned. His father, John, attempted to save him and drowned as well. Their funeral was the first event held at the new Bellefield Church building at the corner of Fifth and Bellefield. That building would burn to the ground the following December and was eventually replaced with the stone building, of which only the bell tower remains. The father and son were buried in Allegheny Cemetery. The 1870 and 1880 censuses show Annie Davison living with only her three surviving children and a live-in servant.

Annie Davidson began work on 234 North Dithridge Street in 1893, the same year her daughter Mary married Robert R. Reed. Given the timing, it is possible the home was intended as a wedding gift, although the Reeds remained at the Davidson house on Fifth Avenue after marriage.

The 1900 Census shows Annie Davidson as living in her home on 5th Avenue with her son, Neville, 39, and her daughter and son-in-law, Mary and Robert Reed. Mary and Robert had been married for six years and had no children. The family also lived with two servants in 1900, Annia Murphy, a cook, and Maggie J. McGraw, a chambermaid. Both were single and 26, and both were Irish immigrants, with Annia arriving in 1894, and Maggie arriving in 1891.

Annie Neville Davison died of colon cancer on August 22, 1906 at the age of 77 and was buried in Allegheny Cemetery. Mary Reed died two years later on March 24, 1908, following complications from a kidney operation.

#### PATRICK F. & KATHARIN GALLAGHER (Ownership & residence: 1914-1952)

The longest-term residents of 234 North Dithridge Street have been the Gallagher family. Patrick F. Gallagher was born on June 24, 1872 in Allentown, PA. He was the son of Irish immigrants. Katharin Kieffer was born on July 14, 1876 in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

Gallagher rose through the ranks at Duquesne Construction Co. as the company developed a name building many of the churches, schools, and commercial buildings in the Pittsburgh area. Some of the company's notable work during this period includes St. Joseph's Hospital (now Carson Towers) on the South Side in 1909, an early remodel of the Kaufmann's building, Downtown, in 1912, many of the local school buildings, such as the Wilkinsburg School in 1912, and many Catholic Churches, such as St. Ann's, in 1902, and St George's in 1912.

On February 19, 1938 while walking home late at night from a Craig Street restaurant, P. F. Gallagher was struck by a hit-and-run driver and passed away. He was laid to rest in Calvary Cemetery near his son, Philip.

Katharin Gallagher was listed as head of household in the 1940 census. Five of the Gallagher children were still living at home. Kathleen was working as a teacher in a public trade school and had earned

\$2,800 in 1939. Dorothy was teaching at an elementary school and earned \$2,200 in 1939. Alice was a social worker for a private charity earning \$1,200 per year and Daniel was working as a salesman for a food wholesaler. Patrick Jr. was attending college. Katharin Kieffer Gallagher died on March 7, 1952 at the age of 75. She was laid to rest in the family plot in Calvary Cemetery.

#### 4. Significance of the Gallagher-Kieffer House(as extracted from the nomination form)

The Pittsburgh Code of Ordinances, Title 11, Historic Preservation, Chapter 1: Historic Structures, Districts, Sites and Objects lists ten criteria, at least one of which must be met for Historic Designation. The nominator is of the opinion that the Gallagher-Kieffer House meets several of the criteria as follows.

2. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the cultural, historic, architectural, archaeological, or related aspects of the development of the City of Pittsburgh, State of Pennsylvania, Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States;

234 North Dithridge Street is directly associated with the prominent Pittsburgh builder, Patrick F. Gallagher (*This criterion corresponds with Criterion B of the National Register of Historic Places*). While the house was not constructed by P.F. Gallagher, he owned and lived in the house during the period in which he rose to prominence at the Duquesne Construction Company. The home is also reflective of P.F. Gallagher's accomplishments because of the modifications made throughout his lifetime that provide a direct connection back to his work at the Duquesne Construction Company. Specifically, the leaded and stained glass windows created by James Hunt (of Pittsburgh's Hunt Stained Glass Studio) in the entryway, parlor, dining room, bathroom, and main staircase, the plaster cast of St. Benedict from the communion altar rail of St. Benedict above the dining room fireplace, and the unusual use of concrete in the kitchen and mudroom floor were all installed by craftsman that collaborated with P.F. Gallagher during his work at the Duquesne Construction Company.

P.F. Gallagher's work at the Duquesne Construction Company had an extensive and lasting impact on the built legacy throughout Pittsburgh and Western Pennsylvania, particularly on ecclesiastical architecture within the Catholic Diocese. Examples of the Duquesne Construction Company's work include St. Boniface Church (North Side), St. Paul's Cathedral Grade School, High School, Convent, & Rectory (Oakland), Sacred Heart Church (East End), St. Mart of the Mount School (Mount Washington), St. George's Church (Allentown), St. Adelbert's Church (South Side), and the Bishop's Residence (Pittsburgh). Additional, albeit partial, list of Duquesne Construction Company ecclesiastical projects is included in the supplemental materials (Section D) of this nomination. While the Duquesne Construction Company was primarily known for its construction of religious architecture, they also undertook several notable secular projects under P.F. Gallagher. Notable among these are the foundation for Allegheny General Hospital and a tipple for the Butler Junction Coal Company.

P.F. Gallagher also made significant contributions to Pittsburgh's and Pennsylvania's civic and political spheres. When Mayor William A. Magee was elected for a second term in 1922, he appointed P. F. Gallagher to serve as police magistrate. P.F. Gallagher was originally assigned to work out of the Number 2 Station at Center Avenue, but the 1923 city directory shows him as the magistrate for the Number 3 Station located at 2608 Penn Avenue. As magistrate, P.F. Gallagher ruled on many of court the cases that came through the Number 3 Police Station,

3. Its exemplification of an architectural type, style, or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship;

This building potentially meets this Criterion (this criterion corresponds with Criterion C of the National Register of Historic Places) because of the relative rarity of shingle-style architecture in North Oakland and the unique manner in which this residence was altered by P.F. Gallagher to reflect his work and relationships through the Duquesne Construction Company.

The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission defines Shingle Style architecture as being:

... marked by the presence of shingles on not just the roof, but on the wall surfaces themselves. The first floor walls may be shingled, or of stone or brick. Shingles may also cover gable ends, curving towers and porch columns. Shingle style buildings have a rather monochrome appearance since the shingles are unpainted and uniformly cover most exterior surfaces. In shape and form, the Shingle style resembles the Queen Anne style, but it lacks the abundant decorative details. Porches are expansive, often wrapping around the front and sides of the building. Roofs are generally sweeping and multi-gabled. Windows are small and multi-paned and are often grouped in pairs or triples.

Characteristic elements that reflect Shingle Style architecture at 234 North Dithridge Street can be seen in the steeply-pitched gambrel roof, shingled second floor walls without corner boards, integral porch, and the absence of highly-decorative detailing. In North Oakland, and perhaps much of Pittsburgh, Shingle Style architecture in residential architecture is relatively rare occurrence, with a strong preference for Richardsonian Romanesque architecture from this period. A review of the plat maps from 1890 and 1903 included in this nomination illustrate that 234 North Dithridge Street was one of two wooden homes constructed on the block (the second has since been demolished) and one of just a couple constructed within several blocks. Additionally, the aforementioned alterations made to the home by P.F. Gallagher (the inclusion of stained glass windows being the most visible from a public right-of-way) further contribute to the relative uniqueness of this historic resource. The building represents an adaptation of the style to the four-square building typology.

#### 5. Integrity

Gallagher-Kieffer House enjoys a high degree of integrity of location, design, workmanship, feeling, and association. Gallagher-Kieffer House remains in its original location and has not been substantially altered since it was owned by P.F. & Katharin Gallagher other than the introduction of several storm windows on the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> floors, as well as the addition of an external, covered staircase to the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor that is clad in materials reflective of the overall design and style of the house.

The Gallagher-Kieffer House also enjoys a moderate degree of integrity regarding setting in that it remains in residential setting but one that it is significantly more developed than when the house was first constructed. On the Eastern Side of North Dithridge Street, the Camelot Apartments, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, and the Dithridge House apartment complex, as well as the One on Centre Apartments are all 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century additions to the neighborhood that reflect the growing density of Oakland at the expense of the single-family late 19<sup>th</sup> century homes that first defined the neighborhood. Houses on the western side of North Dithridge Street are more reflective of the Gallagher-Kieffer House's original setting.

# 6. Photos







# 7. Maps



#### 8. Recommendation of the Historic Review Commission

The Historic Review Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation of the Gallagher-Kieffer House. On August 5, 2020 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate the Gallagher-Kieffer House as historic

#### 9. Recommendation of the City Planning Commission

The City Planning Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation the Gallagher–Kieffer House. On September 15, 2020 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate the Gallagher-Kieffer House as historic.

10. Meeting Minutes

# HRC MINUTES – JULY 1, 2020 – PRELIMINARY DETERMINATION HEARING

Gallagher-Kiefer House 234 N. Dithridge Street

Historic Nomination Owner: Estate of Dorothy Gallagher c/o Kathleen Gallagher, Trustee 234 N. Dithridge Street Pittsburgh, Pa 15213 Ward: 4th Lot and Block: 27-H-115 Nominator: Matthew Falcone Nomination Received: 5/15/20 National Register Status: Listed: Eligible: Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation. Discussion: 1. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation on the property. She states that the nominator found that the property is significant under Criterion 2, identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the cultural, historic,

architectural, archaeological, or related aspects of the development of the City of

Pittsburgh, State of Pennsylvania, Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States, and

Criterion 3, exemplification of an architectural type, style, or design

distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail,

materials, or craftsmanship, and that the property does retain integrity.

2. The Commission discusses the nomination.

Motion:

1. Mr. Green moves to confirm the viability of the historic nomination based on the listed criteria.

2. Ms. Loysen seconds.

3. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carrie

HRC MINUTES – AUGUST 5, 2020 RECOMMENDATION

Gallagher-Kiefer House 234 N. Dithridge Street Historic Nomination Owner: Estate of Dorothy Gallagher c/o Kathleen Gallagher, Trustee 234 N. Dithridge Street Pittsburgh, Pa 15213 Ward: 4th Lot and Block: 27-H-115 Nominator: Matthew Falcone Nomination Received: 5/15/20 National Register Status: Listed: Eligible: Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation. Discussion: 1. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation on the property. She states that the nominator found

that the property is significant under Criterion 2, identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the cultural, historic, architectural, archaeological, or related aspects of the development of the City of Pittsburgh, State of Pennsylvania, Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States, and Criterion 3, exemplification of an architectural type, style, or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship, and that the property does retain integrity.

2. Ms. Aguirre asks for public comment; there is none. She notes that they did receive an email in support of the nomination from Kathy Gallagher, who is the granddaughter of the builder of this house as well as St. John Vianney.

3. The Commission discusses the nomination.

Motion: 1. Mr. Green moves to make a positive recommendation based on the listed criteria. 2. Mr. Hill seconds. 3. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries

PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES –SEPTEMBER 15, 2020

2. DCP-HN-2020-00370, Gallagher-Kieffer House, Historic Nomination Ms. Quinn made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. Ms. Quinn explained PC members nomination information, district and zoning information, and history of construction and use. In addition, she explained criteria for nomination and planning staff recommendation.

4 Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the public. Mr. Matthew Falcone from Preservation Pittsburgh informed that Gallagher-Kieffer House is an exceptional structure, special as architectural example and calls attention to everyone. Mr. Falcone asked PC members to approve the proposed nomination. There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh provides a positive recommendation to City Council for the nomination of Gallagher-Kieffer House, DCP-HN2020-00370 for listing as a City- designated historic site.

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick

SECONDED BY: Ms. Deitrick IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Blackwell, Dick, O'Neill RECUSED: OPPOSED:

MOTION CARRIED