# Bill 2018-1213

# NOMINATION OF THE WESTINGHOUSE MEMORIAL TO BE DESIGNATED AS A CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK

CITY COUNCIL REPORT



CITY COUNCIL REPORT

## WESTINGHOUSE MEMORIAL - HISTORIC NOMINATION STAFF REPORT

Name of Property	. Westinghouse Memorial
Address of Property	. West Circuit Road, Schenley Park
Property Owner	. City of Pittsburgh
Nominated by:	. Mr. Matthew Falcone
Date Received:	. September 14, 2018
Parcel No.:	. 27-S-150-000-01
Ward:	. 14th
Zoning Classification:	. RD1-L
Neighborhood	. Oakland
Council District:	. 8 - Strassburger

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE HISTORIC REVIEW COMMISSION:

- 1. Act on the Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for Historic Designation (October 3, 2018)
- 2. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (November 7, 2018)
- 3. Review the Report prepared by staff for the property in question, and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (November 7, 2018)

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION:

- 4. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (December 4, 2018)
- 5. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (December 4, 2018)

# FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE CITY COUNCIL:

- 6. Conduct a public hearing
- 7. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and the City Planning Commission and take action on the Historic Designation

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

## FACTS

**1.** OnSeptember 14, 2018, the staff of the Historic Review Commission received an application for the nomination of the Westinghouse Memorial to be designated as a City Historic Landmark.

# 2. Description of the Westinghouse Memorial (as *extracted from the nomination form*)

The architectural components of the monument were designed in a modern style with heavy Beaux Arts influences and consist of three independent panels curved in a near semi-circle. Facing the central panel is a freestanding bronze statue, *the Spirit of American Youth*, stands on a pedestal in the middle of a granite peninsula that extends into the pond. A small granite wall marks the perimeter of this component in a way that is purposefully reminiscent of a boat's prow. The statue is a life-size depiction of an adolescent boy holding a crumpled hat in his right hand and two books in his left. Just behind the statue and a step down (to the west) is a small granite bench. All constructed elements of the memorial rest on platforms of black Norwegian granite. The Norwegian granite is arranged in irregular, differently colored blocks lighter than the dark granite foundations.

All three solid bronze panels are approximately ten feet high and about twelve to fifteen feet wide and sit atop a base of alternating black granite and sculpted bronze registers. The upper half of the left & right panels have three openings embellished with a penetrated oak leaf background and framed by an elaborate, stylized scrollwork border. The center of each is a bas-relief panel depicts an accomplishment from the life of George Westinghouse and is supported by two turtles, evocative of the world turtle motif. Below each bas-relief panel is a rectangular granite plaque engraved with the corresponding accomplishments depicted above.

# 3. History of the Westinghouse Memorial (as extracted from the nomination form)

George Westinghouse, an eminent Pittsburgher, prolific inventor, and world-renowned industrialist was dead to begin with. His passing on March 12, 1914 sent the world into a state of morning and prominent leaders, Westinghouse workers, and Pittsburgh officials attended his funeral en masse. While there were calls at that time to find an appropriate way to memorialize the inventor's life, it would be nearly two years until a course of action took shape around Solitude, Westinghouse's home in Homewood. It would be another sixteen years before the dedication of the Westinghouse Memorial in Schenley Park.

The Pittsburgh Press reported on September 19, 1916 that Pittsburgh City Council initiated the movement to erect a memorial to the late George Westinghouse, asking the mayor to appoint a commission of five to consider the matter. However, it was the Engineer's Society of Western Pennsylvania that would take the first step to create a memorial to Westinghouse by attempting to raise \$400,000 dollars to by his home on Thomas Blvd. so that it could be turned into a memorial and the grounds turned into a public park. At the time of publication in the Post-Gazette on October 26th, 1916 they had raised nearly half that sum towards the endeavor.

It was not until 1926, however, that the focus of a memorial in Schenley Park was set forth in earnest. On September 22, 1926 City Council granted the request to place the proposed George Westinghouse memorial in Schenley Park and referred to the matter to the art department and department of public works "as a matter of routine." On December 28th, 1926 the art commission approved the site selection in Schenley Park.

Over the course of the next four years, the Westinghouse Memorial Association worked to raise funds, hire architects, sculptors, and landscape designers to bring the memorial into fruition. While the exact pace and timeline of work is unknown, notes from the dedication day paperwork provide insight into this period of

#### CITY COUNCIL REPORT

time. Henry Hornbostel, Eric Fisher Wood, David Chester French, and Paul Fjelde would ultimate be selected for the architectural and sculptural components. The Gorham Bronze Company (R.I.) cast the bronze, Harrison Granite Company (N.Y.), John Hass, Ezra Stiles, and Chester H. Sadler were selected for landscaping, and the S.M. Siesel Company was selected for general contracting. Massaniello Piccirilli, working with French, modeled the entire memorial in wax, a process that took roughly 14 months.

By all available accounts, the time it took to create the structural components of the memorial was disproportionately brief when compared to the time, labor, and materials invested into the landscaping. A photograph depicting the site of the memorial with granite bases without the bronze panels they would support provides a visual clue to the pace and methodology of construction. Planting reportedly took two springs to complete and prominent existing landscape features (such as the willow trees) were maintained and were accompanied by other plantings that reflected every species of tree within Schenley Park itself. The surrounding area of the pond received 60 tons of peat, 30 tons of top soil, and 2000 pounds of fertilizer.

As the dedication day approached, Mayor Kline declared October 6, 1930 "Westinghouse Day" as other preparations were finalized. Special trains were chartered to bring in prominent political and industrial figures from New York, parking areas were established near the memorial that would accommodate over 700 cars, and special broadcasting equipment brought in so that the proceedings could be broadcast live. Alternate arrangements were also made and in the event of unfavorable weather the ceremony would be held inside the Syria Mosque.

The weather, however, was surprisingly warm and dry for a Pittsburgh fall and the dedication continued as planned. At 2:30pm, participants of the dedication ascended the rostrum and the ceremonies proceeded with the Westinghouse Band playing a rendition of "The Star Spangled Banner." The Right Reverend Bishop Mann pronounced the invocation, which was followed by the band playing a rendition of "The Bohemian Girl" and opening remarks were made by A.L. Humphrey, chairman of the celebration and a trustee of the Westinghouse Memorial Committee. Humphrey concluded his remarks by reading a letter from President Hoover and the Secretary of the Treasury, A.W. Mellon.

Several speeches followed these opening remarks. The Honorable James F. Burke delivered the dedication address, Geogre Munro (former president of the Westinghouse Air Brake Company Veteran Employees Association) presented the memorial to the City of Pittsburgh, and Mayor Charles H. Kline accepted the gift and provided closing remarks, with these words about the memorial itself among them:

Soot and dust and dirt may begrime this shaft. Time may cause it to decay and pass away but when a thousand years have rolled by and time as moved that much nearer to eternity the readers of history will find, still brilliant and resplendent on the scroll of the rolls of illustrious figures, the name of George Westinghouse.

After the dedication, a banquet was held for the dignitaries and other special guests at the William Penn Hotel, downtown during which additional speeches were made and guests were treated to a miniature cake version of the Westinghouse Memorial.

After the dedication, the landscape of the memorial continued to evolve in a manner reflective of its creation. On May 3rd, 1931 it was announced that:

Pittsburgh accustomed to making an annual trip to Washington D.C., each spring to view the blossoming of the Japanese cherry trees may be able to see a similar sight next year in Schenley Park. Forty of the trees famed for their colorful spring appearance will be planted Saturday near the George Westinghouse Memorial in the park as a tribute of Japanese affiliated with the Westinghouse organization in the past 40 years.

On May 7, 1931 K. Hirayama, representing the Japanese Society of Mitsubishi Electrical Engineering Company of Tokyo, presented the trees to Public Works Director Edward G. Lang and Parks Superintendent

James Moore and planted several of the trees in a ceremony. Years later, Henry Hornbostel would join parks superintendent in admiring the blossoms.

#### 4. Significance of the Westinghouse Memorial (as extracted from the nomination form)

The Pittsburgh Code of Ordinances, Title 11, Historic Preservation, Chapter 1: Historic Structures, Districts, Sites and Objects lists ten criteria, at least one of which must be met for Historic Designation. The nominator is of the opinion that the Westinghouse Memorials meets several of the criteria as follows.

#### 3. Exemplification of a distinguished architectural type, style, or design

The Westinghouse Memorial is of exceptional design distinguished by innovation, rarity, and uniqueness because it does not rigidly adhere to any particular design approach. Scholarly consensus since the time of its creation has generally defined the memorial as "modern" in style because it does not employ stylistic elements from any defined artistic movement but rather integrates traditional design approaches with modern building materials. We're given insight into the impetus of this approach in WABCO's 1930 edition:

The committee of the Westinghouse Memorial Association was entirely responsible for diverting the sculptor and the architect away from the classic interpretation of this monument. It was their good sense of propriety that prevailed upon Mr. French to attempt to produce a "modern" masterpiece.

Walter Kidney's own interpretation of the moment's style echoes that of the committee when he states:

This monument to an eminent Pittsburgh, George Westinghouse, is modern is style, in that its general design recalls no other period. It's heavy, richly molded base and its figurative sculpture and abundance of leafy ornament have a traditional feeling to them, and the reverse-curve top, soft in effect, acts as a gently expressive device in what is mostly a hard, dark monument.

The divergence from the strict adherence to traditional styles in the Westinghouse Memorial is exceptional when viewed through the lens of the artists and architects involved in its design. Both Hornbostel and French were internationally renowned for their interpretation and application of Beaux Arts design principles and while their aesthetic is still present in the memorial, it is subdued and applied to express the unique synthesis of its physical setting and subject matter.

The Beaux Arts in the United States spanned roughly from 1880 to 1920. The name Beaux Arts was derived from the Parisian École des Beaux-Arts, one of the most influential arts schools in France. The first American architects to study at the École were Richard Morris Hunt and Henry Hobson Richardson, architect of the Allegheny County Courthouse. These architects, among others, are credited with having brought the precepts of the Beaux Arts to the United States in the late 19th century. Later, Henry Hornbostel, architect of the City-County Building, would also study at the École after graduating from Columbia University in 1891.

The Beaux Arts mode can most succinctly be described as a particular type of neoclassicism wherein idealized, classical elements are interwoven with French and Italian Baroque and Rococo elements. It was largely a means of adapting and utilizing historic forms for contemporary uses; sometimes bordering on Eclecticism. Among its chief hallmarks, symmetry, spatial hierarchy, sculpture, and classical detailing were paramount. Architectural historian Leland Roth states that one of the key unifying elements of the mode was that architects and designers sought to "…create an environment that was harmonious in the interrelationship of all of its elements." It was less about following strict architectural guidelines and more about creating an architecture of feeling.

The Westinghouse Memorial achieves just that.

The plan of the granite work of the monument, the piercing of the bronze work and the gold-leafing thereof, and the landscaping have all been considered of equal importance. The building of paths, the setting of granite benches, the produce planting and tree dentistry of the most important trees all helped to bring about a complete, artistic, interesting ensemble.

#### CITY COUNCIL REPORT

However typical Beaux Arts approaches do not consume the memorial and there is a purposeful break in style and subject matter that portends more modern approaches. For example, Hornbostel's architectural renderings of the proposed memorial included a bust medallion of George Westinghouse in the central panel flanked by two woman, drapery obscuring only their hips and legs. The steering committee specifically broke with this approach, flanking the bust of Westinghouse with bas-relief sculptures of typical Westinghouse workers. The presence of mechanical workers and laborers in pieces of fine art would become fairly common through the 1930s because of the efforts of New Deal programs like the Federal Art Project and individual interests of artists like Diego Rivera. However, at the time of the creation of the Westinghouse Memorial, their presence remained atypical.

4. <u>Its identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history of development of the City of Pittsburgh, the State of Pennsylvania, the Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States</u>

The Westinghouse Memorial was designed by Henry Hornbostel, a renowned Pittsburgh architect noted for his significant contributions in and around the country, in collaboration with Eric Fisher Wood, a nationally acclaimed engineer. It also is associated with the artistic contributions of sculptors Daniel Chester French and Paul Fjelde.

Henry Hornbostel was a prominent, École des Beaux-Arts-trained American architect.

Hornbostel came to Pittsburgh c. 1904 to design the campus of Carnegie Tech (now Carnegie Mellon University). He founded the Department of Architecture at Carnegie Tech around the same time. As his career progressed, Hornbostel chose Pittsburgh as his base for independent practice, but he also resided and worked in New York. Over the course of his career, he was partner in the firms of Howell, Stokes & Hornbostel; Wood, Palmer & Hornbostel; Palmer & Hornbostel; and Palmer, Hornbostel & Jones.

A few of Hornbostel's representative works in Pittsburgh include Rodef Shalom, Soldiers' and Sailors' National Military Museum and Memorial, numerous buildings on the Carnegie Tech (Carnegie Mellon) campus, Thaw Hall at the University of Pittsburgh, Smithfield Congregational Church, and Congregation B'nai Israel. Notable works outside of Pittsburgh include the Queensboro Bridge (Jointly with Gustav Lindenthal, New York), Hell Gate Bridge (also jointly with Lindenthal, New York), Williamsburg Bridge (New York), New York State Education Department Building (Albany), New York Public Library (New York), and City Hall (Oakland, CA).

# Eric Fisher Wood

Born in New York in 1889, Wood was education at various private institutions before enrolling at Yale University, where he would eventually graduate with a degree in Civil Engineering. Wood is most noted for his extensive service during World War I and his role in founding the American Legion in 1919. After the war, Wood would move to Pittsburgh and established himself as a prominent architect and would work as such before being recalled to duty in World War II.

# **Daniel Chester French**

Born in Exeter, New Hampshire French enjoyed a diverse early education that ranged from the study of anatomy from William Rimmer and drawing under William Morris Hunt. French would study at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology for several years before moving to Italy to study sculpture in the studio of Thomas Ball. Upon his return to America, he established studios in Washington, D.C., Boston, and eventually New York where he would design dozens of nationally prominent sculpted works.

French only has two representative works in Pittsburgh, the Westinghouse Memorial and the *Colonel James Anderson Monument* (1904), which was dismantled in the 1960s and recreated in the 1980s. Representative works outside of Pittsburgh include *Abraham Lincoln* (Washington, D.C.), *Statue of the Republic* (centerpiece of the World's Columbian Exposition, Chicago, 1893), *Alma Mater* (New York),

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

Dupont Circle Fountain (Washington, D.C.), Wisconsin (Madison, W.I.), General George Washington (Paris).

In addition to his significant sculptural contributions French played a leading role in advancing, and in many cases establishing, national institutions devoted to the fine arts. He was a founding member of the U.S. Commission of Fine Arts, the National Arts Commission, and the National Sculpture Society. He also served as a trustee of the Metropolitan Museum of Fine Arts for nearly three decades and is largely responsible for the accession of the museum's core collection of American sculpture.

French's contributions to the Westinghouse Memorial may be see in the sculpting the bronze portrait relief of George Westinghouse (central panel), figural reliefs (central and flanking panels), and the freestanding statue of *The Spirit of American Youth*. French's contributions to the Westinghouse Memorial are significant when viewed through the lens of the rarity of his contributions to Pittsburgh's sculptural art and also through the context of this work with his overall oeuvre. The typical expression of French's works tend to be freestanding statuary and, in instances such as the Nobel Peace Prize Medal, bas-relief. But the synthesis of the two sculptural forms into a designed landscape with architectural form is a relative rarity.

# **Paul Fjelde**

Fjelde's accomplishments including teaching at the Pratt Institute of Art, served as chairman of the Sculpture Department at the Carnegie Institute of Technology, and was an instructor of sculpture at the National Academy Museum and School of Fine Arts. Fjelde also served as an editor of *Sculpture Review* between 1951 and 1955.

Among Fjelde's most commonly recognized sculptural works is the Lincoln Monument in Frogner Park in Oslo. On July 4, 1914, North Dakota Governor Louis Hanna presented the bronze bust of Abraham Lincoln to the nation of Norway. During World War II, the bust in Frogner Park became a center for silent protest against Occupation of Norway by Nazi Germany.

In the Westinghouse Memorial, Fjelde is responsible for the six bas-relief panels that illustrate George Westinghouse's accomplishments that flank the two side panels. The panels diverge from Fjelde's previous works in their design, subject matter, and execution in that the majority of his commissioned works to this point were either representations of a mythological or historical persons.

10. <u>Its unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pittsburgh</u>

The Westinghouse Memorial maintains a distinctive physical appearance and is an established visual feature of Schenley Park. The bronze of the memorial creates a striking visual contrast between the verdant pastoral setting and helps to establish a person-made sense of place not immediately apparent from the curvilinear pathways and roads that encircle the open space. While open spaces are not a rare feature of Schenley Park, those created by freestanding bodies of water are significantly less common. The shore of the lily pond on which the Westinghouse Memorial stands is one of two such features in Schenley Park, the other being the substantially larger Panther Hollow Lake.

#### CITY COUNCIL REPORT

# 5. Integrity

The Westinghouse Memorial retains a high degree of integrity in location, design, setting, workmanship, feeling, and association. The monument remains in its original location in Shenley Park, framed by a pond and highly manicured landscape surrounds. The design of the memorial retains nearly all features as part of the original design by Henry Hornbostel, Eric Fisher Wood, David Chester French, and Paul Fjelde.

The memorial retains a high degree of material integrity despite the loss of its gold leaf covering of the figural representations in the panels and the Spirit of American Youth. It should also be noted that the original landscape design (including existing and future plantings) for the memorial are noted by Hornbostel but have changed over time. For example, it is apparent that several (but not all) of the cherry trees added to the memorial by the Japanese Society of Mitsubishi Electrical Engineering Company of Tokyo remain. However, the fundamental principles of landscape design that, in some instances, predate the existence of the memorial still remain with the presence of the pond, tree line, and plantings.

6. Photos





#### CITY COUNCIL REPORT

7. Maps



# 8. Recommendation of the Historic Review Commission

The Historic Review Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation of the Westinghouse Memorial. On November 7, 2018 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate the Westinghouse Memorial as historic

# 9. Recommendation of the City Planning Commission

The City Planning Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation the Westinghouse Memorial. On December 4, 2018 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate the Westinghouse Memorial as historic.

10. Meeting Minutes

HRC MINUTES - OCTOBER 3, 2018 - PRELIMINARY DETERMINATION HEARING

Westinghouse Memorial	Pittsburgh HRC – October 3, 2018 Historic Nomination
<b>Owner:</b> City of Pittsburgh	Ward: 14th
	Lot and Block:
<b>Nominator:</b> Matthew Falcone 417 Lockhart Street Pittsburgh, Pa 15212	Inspector:
	Council District:
	Nomination Received: 9/14/18

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation.

# **Discussion:**

1. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation on the nomination. She states that the property is significant under **Criterion 3**, exemplification of an architectural type, style or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship, **Criterion 4**, identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City of Pittsburgh, the State of Pennsylvania, the Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States, and **Criterion 10**, unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pittsburgh.

# Motion:

- 1. Mr. Gastil moves that the nomination is viable.
- 2. Ms. Loysen seconds.
- 3. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

# HRC MINUTES - NOVEMBER 7, 2018 RECOMMENDATION

Pittsburgh HRC – November 7, 2018 Historic Nomination
Ward: 14th
Lot and Block:
Inspector:
Council District:
Nomination Received: 9/14/18

# National Register Status: Listed:

**Eligible:** 

Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation.

# **Discussion:**

- 2. Ms. Quinn provides the staff report and states that the boundary for the nomination was adjusted since the nomination was submitted. She states that they will be making a recommendation to City Council today. She states that at the last hearing the property was found to be potentially significant under **Criterion 3**, exemplification of an architectural type, style or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship, **Criterion 4**, identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City of Pittsburgh, the State of Pennsylvania, the Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States, and **Criterion 10**, unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pittsburgh.
- 3. Mr. Falcone reads into the record some additional information recording the materiality of the monument as well as information about the existence of a time capsule.

# **Motion:**

- 4. Mr. Gastil moves to make a positive recommendation to City Council.
- 5. Ms. Loysen seconds.
- 6. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

# PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES – DECEMBER 4, 2018

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

#### 2. <u>Hearing and Action</u>: Historic Nomination: Westinghouse Memorial

Ms. Quinn made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Ms. Quinn recommended approval of the proposal.

Ms. Quinn presented the logistics of the Westinghouse Memorial which lies in the northwestern section of Schenley Park in Pittsburgh, Pa and is comprised of architectural, sculpted, and landscape elements that are roughly bounded by Schenely Drive to the north and west. The landscape design elements include plantings that flank a concrete footpath connecting Schenley Drive

The Westinghouse Memorial meets the criteria in Section 1001.4 because it exemplifies a distinguished architectural type, style, or design. It is a landmark and in uniquely located and was designed by Henry Hornbostel, a renowned Pittsburgh architect noted for his significant contributions in and around the county.

She concluded by asking the commission to make a positive recommendation to City Council.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Matthew Falcone of Preservation Pittsburgh, the nominator of this application spoke in support of the positive recommendation to City Council. He said there is tremendous support of this nomination.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no more questions or comments from the Commissioners, the

Chairwoman called for the motion.

<u>MOTION:</u> That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh provide a positive recommendation to City Council.

MOVED BY Ms. Dick; SECONDED BY Ms. Deitrick.

IN FAVOR: Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Mingo, O'Neill

OPPOSED: None

**CARRIED**