CITY COUNCIL REPORT



PENNSYLVANIA NATIONAL BANK Beezer Bros., Architects

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

THE PENNSYLVANIA NATIONAL BANK - HISTORIC NOMINATION STAFF REPORT

Name of Property	The Pennsylvania National Bank
Address of Property	3480 Butler Street
Property Owner	Mr. Chip Desmone
Nominated by:	Matthew Falcone
Date Received:	August 15, 2019
Parcel No.:	. 48-S-268
Ward:	. 6th
Zoning Classification:	LNC
Neighborhood	Lawrenceville
Council District:	. 7 – Gross

FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE HISTORIC REVIEW COMMISSION:

- 1. Act on the Preliminary Determination of Eligibility for Historic Designation (4 September 2019)
- 2. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (2 October 2019)
- 3. Review the Report prepared by staff for the property in question, and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (2 October 2019)

FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION:

- 4. Conduct a public hearing for the Historic Designation (19 November 2019)
- 5. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and make a recommendation to the City Council on the Historic Designation (19 November 2019)

FORMAL ACTION REQUIRED BY THE CITY COUNCIL:

- 6. Conduct a public hearing
- 7. Review the recommendations of the Historic Review Commission and the City Planning Commission and take action on the Historic Designation

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

FACTS

1. On August 15, 2019 the staff of the Historic Review Commission received an application for the nomination of The Pennsylvania National Bank to be designated as a City Historic Structure.

2. Description of The Pennsylvania National Bank (as *extracted from the nomination form*)

The Pennsylvania National Bank Building is a one-story brick and terracotta building in the Beaux Arts style. The overall form of the building is that of a truncated triangle, its narrow primary façade directly faces the intersection of Penn Avenue, Butler Street, and 34th Street, with its two sides fronting Butler Street and Penn Avenue. The bricks of the building are of non-standard size and vary in shades from taupe to a light brown color. A wrought iron fence embedded in a limestone base extends from the Butler Street and Penn Avenue facades of the building to form a triangular courtyard immediately in front of the building's main entrance. Material and photographic evidence indicates the Penn Avenue fencing was partially removed and reconfigured relatively early in the building's history.

The primary façade is a single bay with a double door at the center, above it is a transom light bearing the name of the current resident of the building, Desmone Architects. Above the doorway is a larger transom supported by corbels, over which sits a large semicircular tripartite window. This window is surmounted by a two-step arch with curved brick work between the step, the keystone of which also serve as a decorative corbel supporting the architrave. The door is flanked on either side by engaged pilasters that rise up to the entablature. The architrave, supported by the pilasters and the keystone-corbel of the large window, projects slightly and bears ornamental relief carvings. On the frieze, a large terracotta sign sits in the center that reads "PENNSYLVANIA NATIONAL BANK". The cornice also bears ornamental relief at the bottom, and projects out.

The Butler Street façade is five bays across on the original building and is symmetrical, with the two outermost bays being identical as well as the three central bays. The street level of Butler is lower, revealing the stone foundation and a short stone register with inoperable two-over-two square windows to the basement. On the main register the two outermost bays project out slightly and each feature a double-hung, two-over-two window with a projecting sill, two narrow pilasters surmounted by corbels that support a pediment, with a tympanum decorated in relief. The three central bays, divided by engaged pilasters, each feature a large arched tripartite window with a projecting sill that evoke the arched window on the primary façade. Each window is surrounded by the same curved two-step brick arch as the front's semicircular window, here spanning the entire height of the window. All three arches also repeat the keystone-corbel from the front façade to support the architrave. The entablature continues from the front façade, here with the brick of the frieze visible. At the division of the bays, the frieze is decorated with terracotta medallions with high relief carving. The Penn Avenue façade mirrors this side.

The rear wall of the first addition is not parallel with the rear of the building; therefore, one bay faces Penn Avenue and three face Butler Street. These bays evoke the large arched windows of the side façade with less ornamentation. The two-step arch is replicated around these windows, but the curved brickwork between the steps is replace with straight bricks. Due to the differing elevations of Butler Street and Penn Avenue, more of the building's stone foundation is visible on the Butler Street side, with three visible exit doors.

The building's low-pitched hipped roof is not visible from the street due to the presence of the low, crenellated parapet wall that surrounds it. On the primary façade, this parapet wall bears the Pennsylvania Keystone symbol on a circular plaque, surmounted by an ornamental arch. A second, recently completed, addition on the rear of the building fronts both Butler St. and Penn Ave. and compliments the original building in scale and massing but is distinguished by its composition of metal, glass, and brick.

3. History of The Pennsylvania National Bank (as extracted from the nomination form)

The building that immediately predated the construction of the current resource dated to 1870, was three stories tall, and housed the Lawrence Savings Bank until 1893 when it was purchased by the Pennsylvania National Bank. The Pennsylvania National Bank operated in the building until 1902 when it was razed to make way for new construction.

As early as March of 1901 bank officials began making plans for the construction of a new building. Their initial plan was to construct a building at least as large or larger than the previous three-story building but it was decided instead to construct more ornate one-story building. The architect for the new bank was chosen by competition and because of the change in design approach by the bank the entrants' plans were returned after the initial submissions and new plans were solicited. The winner of the competition was a local firm run by the Beezer Brothers who were mostly noted for their house and church construction in Altoona, Johnstown, and Greensburg. Locally, they were also notable for designing Saint John the Baptist Church (today known as the Church Brew Works). The Pennsylvania National Bank hired the contracting firm of Calhoun & Miller to construct the building. George Calhoun and John F. Miller were Lawrenceville residents who had built several small houses, stables, and garages throughout the city with particularly high concentrations in Lawrenceville, Highland Park, and Friendship. Demolition on the earlier Lawrence Savings Bank began in May of 1902, and the new building opened one year later on May 30, 1903.

The first president of the Pennsylvania National Bank was Colonel Algernon Sidney Mountain Morgan, born May 9, 1831 in Morganza, a large farm near Canonsburg owned by his family since 1796. Morgan came from a line of military officers including his grandfather General John Morgan and great-grandfather Colonel George Morgan, who served as an agent of Indian Affairs during the Revolutionary War and was the brother of John Morgan, second Surgeon General of the Army. A. S. M. Morgan graduated from the Western University of Pennsylvania in 1847 and worked in surveying for the Ohio & Pennsylvania and the Pittsburgh & Ohio Railroads, as well as starting a successful coke production and shipping interest, until 1861, when he volunteered to fight in the Civil War and served as lieutenant colonel of the 63rd Pennsylvania Infantry. Morgan served for just over a year until he was injured at the Battle of Seven Pines (Fair Oaks) and discharged from active duty. In 1863 Morgan was appointed as the storekeeper of the Ordinance Department of the Allegheny Arsenal in Lawrenceville, where he served for thirty years until he retired (due to cataracts) in 1894. Before his retirement from the U.S. Army, Morgan opened the Pennsylvania National Bank in 1893 and served as its president until his death in 1914.

The bank's first vice-president who succeeded Morgan as president after his death was Joseph Sidney Seaman. Seaman was born in Harmony, Butler County, Pennsylvania on August 14, 1839. Seaman moved to Pittsburgh in 1847 and began work in the steel industry with Samuel Leonard and then later with the Pittsburgh Foundry Co., where he learned the skills and business behind turning rolls, the large metal cylinders used to shape steel as it is produced. Seaman enlisted in the army during the Civil War but his unit was not called into service. In 1869 he began his own foundry firm, which operated under several different names until 1885, when it was incorporated as the Seaman-Sleeth Co. Seaman assisted George Westinghouse in the development of his locomotive airbrake and the first models of the airbrake were cast in Seaman's foundry. At the company's height, the foundry owned and operated by Seaman covered two full city blocks in Lawrenceville. Seaman was instrumental in the formation of the American Foundrymen's Association (now known as the American Foundry Society), an organization that works for innovation in the steel industry. During the association's first Pittsburgh conference in 1899, Seaman was elected its third president and also gave personal donations to establish a fund for research in foundry technology. He became the Pennsylvania National Bank's second president in 1914 and served until his death in 1921. Seaman was succeeded as president by Joseph A. Kelly, who served the bank's dissolution in 1932.

4. Significance of The Pennsylvania National Bank (as extracted from the nomination form)

The Pittsburgh Code of Ordinances, Title 11, Historic Preservation, Chapter 1: Historic Structures, Districts, Sites and Objects lists ten criteria, at least one of which must be met for Historic Designation.

2.) Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the cultural, historic, architectural, archaeological, or related aspects of the development of the City of Pittsburgh, State of Pennsylvania, Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States;

The Pennsylvania National Bank Building is associated with two important local figures, namely Colonel A. S. M. Morgan and Joseph Sidney Seaman, the bank's first and second president, respectively. Morgan came from a family with a history of military and public service, his great-grandfather was Colonel George Morgan, who served as an "Indian Agent" during the Revolutionary War. Stationed at Fort Pitt, he was tasked with managing diplomacy with local native tribes in an effort to secure their support in the war. Colonel George Morgan was successful in gaining the support of the Lenape Tribe under Chief White Eyes, who served as a guide and fought with the Continental Army in the area around Detroit. George Morgan's brother John Morgan was a prominent physician at the time, he studied medicine in Scotland and France and served as the second "Chief Physician and Director General of the Continental Army," the predecessor to the modern Surgeon General of the United States Army. He also co-founded the American Philosophical Society with other prominent figures including Benjamin Franklin, as well as the College of Philadelphia Medical School (today the School of Medicine of the University of Pennsylvania).

George Morgan inherited a large plot of near Canonsburg, Pennsylvania upon his brother's death and named the area Morganza. There he was invited by former Vice President Aaron Burr into his 1806 conspiracy plot to overthrow the government, which Morgan declined and sent word of warning to President Thomas Jefferson and was one of 140 witnesses at his eventual treason trial. George Morgan's son John Morgan was also an Army officer and served under General Richard Butler at St. Clair's Defeat. John Morgan's son, A. S. M. Morgan's father, joined a company at the age of sixteen to fight in the War of 1812.

Algernon Sidney Mountain (A. S. M.) Morgan was born May 9, 1831 at Morganza, the farm owned by his family. Morgan studied at the Western University of Pennsylvania and graduated in 1847, after which he began a career in surveying for various railroad companies, including the Ohio & Pennsylvania Railroad and the Pittsburgh & Connellsville Railroad. During his time in and around Connellsville he became familiar with the quality of the coal and coke that could be produced there which had not yet been harvested or utilized in large quantities. He entered into a partnership to open the Morgan Mines, which would come to be a major controller of the early Connellsville coke industry before the dominance of Henry Clay Frick, who would later purchase Morgan's coke operation.

At the outbreak of the Civil War, Morgan responded to President Lincoln initial call for volunteers to serve a three-month service with a unit called the City Guards, which became part of the Twelfth Regiment, with Morgan serving as Second Lieutenant. At the expiry of the initial three-months service, the Twelfth was reorganized as the Sixty-Third Regiment with Morgan as Lieutenant Colonel, second in command to Colonel (later Brigadier General) Alexander Hays. Although he had no military training, Morgan was noted for his skill in both tactics and drilling. The Sixty-Third fought with the Army of the Potomac, III Corps, Third Division, First Brigade at the Siege of Yorktown in April 1862 and at the Battle of Williamsburg of May 5. They also fought at the Battle of Seven Pines, where Morgan would be grievously wounded by a musket ball through his hip. He returned for Pittsburgh for medical treatment, and despite the severity of

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

his wounds eventually made a full recovery. Without Morgan, his unit would go on to fight in many major battles including Fredericksburg, Chancellorsville, Gettysburg, and the Battle of the Wilderness. Once Morgan recovered from his wounds he was appointed the military storekeeper of the Ordinance Department at the Allegheny Arsenal in Lawrenceville, where he served until 1894. Morgan then became involved in several local business and philanthropic ventures, including being on the Board of Directors for both the Armenia Insurance Company and the Western Pennsylvania Hospital, before becoming the founding president of the Pennsylvania National Bank.

The Pennsylvania National Bank is also associated with Joseph Sidney Seaman. Seaman moved to Pittsburgh at the age of seventeen in 1847, where he was initially employed as a carpenter. Seaman's involvement with the steel industry began a year later when he entered into the employ of Samuel Leonard, a prominent industrialist noted for being the first American to produce "angle iron," a useful type of bent steel. After four years of work with Leonard, Seaman accepted a position at the Pittsburgh Foundry Co., where he produced the large metal rolls that were used in the production of Pittsburgh's first crucible steel. At the outbreak of the Civil War Seaman was also involved in the turning and production of artillery cannons. Seaman attempted to enlist for the war but a recruiting officer had heard of his skill in steel production, specifically related to cannons, and he was told to remain in Pittsburgh to continue his work. Seaman instead enlisted with an Pittsburgh artillery unit called "Knap's Battery," however they were never called into service. Seaman rose in the ranks in the ranks of the foundry business to foreman then superintendent until 1869 when entered into a partnership to operate his own foundry. The business changed names many times until it was incorporated in 1885 as the Seaman-Sleeth Company. It was at Seaman's plant that the George Westinghouse's railroad airbrake was developed and produced, one of his first widely successful inventions. Seaman was also involved in philanthropic works, he was a founding member of the American Foundrymen's Association, which was involved in workers' advocacy and advancement in the steel industry and served as its president and was widely respected by its members. The association still exists today as the American Foundry Society. Seaman also personally contributed \$5,000 (equivalent to over \$60,000 today) to an endowment fund to reward achievement and innovation in the foundry industry.

3.) Its exemplification of an architectural type, style, or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship;

The Pennsylvania National Bank Building is a superb example of the Beaux Arts style. It features many of its characteristic design elements including the elaborate rounded-arched windows, engaged pilasters, and an eclectic combination of classical elements such as the architrave surmounted by a crenellated parapet wall and ornate combined keystone-corbels. The use of brick and terracotta for Beaux Arts architecture is a stylistic variation unique to this area, most buildings of the style in other locations primarily used more marble and other stone.

Locally, it is similar to other prominent Beaux Arts style buildings in the city that are roughly its contemporary. These include Henry Hornbostel's Soldiers & Sailors Memorial, Rodef Shalom Congregation, and Daniel Burnham's Penn Station. While not quite as imposing as these monumental structures, the Pennsylvania National Bank maintains Beaux Arts' grandiosity and elaborateness on a smaller scale appropriate for a primarily residential neighborhood. The use of Beaux Arts in this building helps convey a sense of wealth and prosperity, which is suited to a financial institution. The use of Beaux Arts also helps to convey a sense of security and permanence, both important commodities for a bank building of the early twentieth century. According to PHMC:

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

The Beaux Arts style, named for the premier French school of architecture, the Ecole des Beaux-Arts, was introduced to the United States by American architects like Richard Morris Hunt who attended the prestigious school in the late nineteenth-century. Hunt designed the Newport, RI mansion of Cornelius Vanderbilt, "The Breakers," in this style in 1892. The Beaux Arts style was most often seen in places where turn-of-the- century wealth was concentrated, major urban centers and resort communities. The popularity of this style was advanced by the World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago in 1893. With its grandiose treatment of classic architectural forms, the Beaux Arts style was seen as an ideal expression of both corporate or wealth and civic pride. Buildings of this style are both formal and monumental with abundant and opulent decorative details. The Beaux Arts style is especially suited for public buildings designed to deliver a strong symbolic message, such as libraries, museums, court houses, train stations, and government offices.

The Beaux Arts style uses formal symmetry, Italian Renaissance form, and classical Greek and Roman decorative elements like columns, pediments and balustrades to create a grand and imposing architectural statement. Exterior decorative details include may include quoins, balconies, terraces, porches, and porticoes as well as ornamental windows and grand entrances. This style also featured lavish interiors including pilasters, arched openings, elaborate chandeliers, coffered ceilings, or marble fireplaces. (Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission)

4.) Its identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City of Pittsburgh, the State of Pennsylvania, the Mid-Atlantic region, or the United States;

The Pennsylvania National Bank building is also significant because of its affiliation with the architectural firm Beezer Brothers (Fig. 8). Twins Louis and Michael Beezer from Bellefonte, Pennsylvania, practiced much of their early work in central and western Pennsylvania before moving their firm to Seattle in 1907. While working in Pennsylvania, they primarily designed houses and churches. Notably, they designed several contributing houses to the Broad Avenue Historic District and the Llyswen Historic District in Altoona, and U.S. Representative George Huff's home in Greensburg, along with several churches in and around Altoona. In Pittsburgh their most well-known building is perhaps St. John the Baptist Church, today known as the Church Brew Works. When their firm moved to Seattle the Beezers became tremendously successful, designing a number of Catholic churches and other notable structures such as the Colman Dock, Nestor Building, and Cathedral School. The Beezer Brothers also designed at least five other banks in Bend, Oregon; Walla Walla, Washington; and Tyrone, Pennsylvania.

The work completed by the Beezer Brothers' in Pennsylvania is notably smaller in number compared to their work out west but significant for being early examples of work in what would become a large body of work. It is clear that the Beezer Brothers developed their craft in Pittsburgh before moving to Seattle, where commissions and work were likely to be more accessible for architects who had been established out east. At this time in history, Seattle was a small logging town that had seen minor booms and busts. It was the discovery of gold in Alaska and the Yukon in the 1890s that lead to a gold rush that helped Seattle rapidly expand into a prominent northeastern port city it remains today. This sudden growth in development, as well as the Alaska-Yukon-Pacific Exposition of 1909, meant that Seattle saw rapid development and growth over the next few decades, and the Beezer Brothers capitalized on a burgeoning architectural market.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

10). Its unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pittsburgh

The Pennsylvania National Bank Building's distinctive design and location at the entrance to Lawrenceville make it a landmark and symbol of the neighborhood. It is an established, familiar feature of the neighborhood due to both its prominent location at the meeting of three major roadways (Penn Avenue, Butler Street, and 34th Street), and its position directly behind Lawrenceville's *Doughboy* statue. Created in 1921 as a memorial to the soldiers of the First World War, the *Doughboy* has long been recognized as the primary symbol of the neighborhood, and the Pennsylvania National Bank Building can be seen in almost all photographs of the statue. Surrounded today by much more modern development, the Pennsylvania National Bank Building is the most prominent building contemporary to the statue in the local area, and is the most significant contributor to its context and surroundings.

5. Integrity

The Pennsylvania National Bank building maintains its integrity to a high degree. Its location is unchanged since construction, and the only changes to the design are replacement doors and windows. The building maintains a high degree of workmanship visible in the detailed ornamentation, and the materials used are either originals or replacements that do not distract from the building's historical character. Although no longer occupied by a banking corporation, the feeling is strongly maintained by the building itself, as well as The Doughboy statue that has been in front of it since 1921. The aspect of integrity that has seen the most deterioration is its setting, at the time of construction the bank was surrounded by dense urban rowhouse development, including immediately behind it. Most of these buildings have been replaced with more modern construction, only a few contemporary buildings still remain. The association of the building with its historic significance is very clear, the Beaux Arts style has strong visual elements which are often associated with banking, as well as the large terracotta plaque that bears the name Pennsylvania National Bank.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

6. Photos





CITY COUNCIL REPORT

7. Maps



NOMINATION OF THE PENNSYLVANIA NATIONAL BANK To be Designated as a City Historic Landmark

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

8. Recommendation of the Historic Review Commission

The Historic Review Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation of The Pennsylvania National Bank. On October 2, 2019 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate The Pennsylvania National Bank as historic.

9. Recommendation of the City Planning Commission

The City Planning Commission held a public hearing regarding the designation of The Pennsylvania National Bank. On November 19, 2019 the Commission voted to recommend to City Council that it designate The Pennsylvania National Bank as historic.

10. Meeting Minutes

HRC MINUTES – SEPTEMBER 4, 2019 – PRELIMINARY DETERMINATION HEARING

Pittsburgh HRC – September 4, 2019

Pennsylvania National Bank 3480 Butler Street

Owner:

Mr. Chip Desmone Desmone Architects 3400 Butler Street Pittsburgh, PA 15201

Nominator:

Matthew Falcone

Historic Nomination

Ward: 6th

Lot and Block: 48-S-268

Inspector:

Council District: 7th

Nomination Received: 8/15/19

National Register Status: Listed: Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation.

Discussion:

1. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation on the property and states that the property meets **Criterion 2**, identification with a person or persons, **Criterion 3**, exemplification of a distinguished architectural type, style, or design, **Criterion 4**, work of an architect, engineer, designer, or builder, and **Criterion 10**, unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence. She also states that it has retained intergrity.

2. The Commission discusses the nomination.

Motion:

- 1. Mr. Green moves to positively assess the nomination based on the criteria identified in the application.
- 2. Mr. Snipe seconds.
- 3. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

HRC MINUTES – OCTOBER 2, 2019 RECOMMENDATION

Pittsburgh HRC – October 2, 2019

Pennsylvania National Bank 3480 Butler Street

Historic Nomination

Ward:	6th
-------	-----

Lot and Block: 48-S-268

Nominator:

Owner:

Matthew Falcone

Mr. Chip Desmone

Desmone Architects 3400 Butler Street Pittsburgh, PA 15201

Inspector:

Council District: 7th

Eligible:

Nomination Received: 8/15/19

National Register Status: Listed:

Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation.

Discussion:

- 3. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation on the property and states that the property meets **Criterion 2**, identification with a person or persons, **Criterion 3**, exemplification of a distinguished architectural type, style, or design, **Criterion 4**, work of an architect, engineer, designer, or builder, and **Criterion 10**, unique location and distinctive physical appearance or presence. She also states that it has retained intergrity.
- 4. Ms. Aguirre asks for public comment; there is none.
- 5. The Commission discusses the nomination.

Motion:

- 4. Mr. Green moves to recommend the nomination based on the criteria identified in the application.
- 5. Ms. Loysen seconds.
- 6. Ms. Aguirre asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES –November 19, 2019